

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, May 19, 2015

4:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: David Cooke, Ben Goodman, Rex Hagerling, Josh Lapp (arrived 6:14 p.m./agenda item #3),
Jason Sudy, Charmaine Sutton (arrived 6:22 p.m./agenda item #3)

Commissioners Absent: Todd Boyer

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER (6:09 p.m.).
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, June 9, 2015
– 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 p.m., Tuesday, June 16, 2015 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, April 21, 2015.
MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (3-0-1 [Hagerling]) APPROVED
- VII. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Special Meeting - Monday, May 4, 2015.
Approve with the following corrections/modifications:
Page 3/Ben Goodman/Bullet 6:
 - Thinks the ~~carriage units~~ *attached units on back of the townhomes* should borrow from the vernacular of the First Avenue townhomes, not from the Mt. Pleasant Avenue house.MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. STAFF APPROVALS
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items (see below) into the formal record.
Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED
- IX. PUBLIC FORUM
- X. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 15-5-13

163 Punta Alley

Heidi Bolyard/Simplified Living Architecture (Applicant)

Gretchen Stephenson (Owner)

Item #1 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the May 12th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Install New Door

Install Closed, Fixed Shutters

2. 15-5-14

1081 North Fourth Street

Barb Judson/Mae Fence (Applicant)

Michael Young (Owner)

Item #2 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the May 12th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Install New Fence

3. 15-5-15

930 & 940 North High Street

H. Christopher Friend/Schooley Caldwell & Assoc. (Applicant)

The Brunner Building, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-5-15, 930 & 940 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Demolition

- Demolish the circa 1940 concrete block building at 940 N. High Street.
- Demolish the highly modified, circa 1945 concrete block and brick building at 930 N. High Street.
- Remove all associated site utilities, including pavement, landscaping, fencing, and other site obstructions.

Excavation and Foundation Work for New Construction

- Begin excavation and foundation work for the proposed new construction, based on the conceptual drawings (dated 05/19/2015) submitted and reviewed at the May 19, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting.
- Final review and approval at a future Italian Village Commission meeting is required for any/all design details, exterior materials, height, massing, signage, and landscaping.
- Site plan to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Reasons for Approval of Demolition:

- Based on a comparison with other existing auto-era buildings in the district, these particular buildings do not possess distinctive architectural features or embody distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.
- Due to extensive modifications, the building at 1930 N. High Street does not retain integrity or convey its historic character.
- The siting and design of the proposed new building, in its conceptual form, is more in keeping with the Short North Design Guidelines than the existing buildings at 930 and 940 N. High Street.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke ((6-0-0) APPROVED

4. 15-5-16

813 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Michael Casey (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-5-16, 813 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Modify Previous Approval

- Modify the previously approved plans (COA # 14-11-24/November 11, 2014), by adding a shed dormer to the east elevation of the garage, per the submitted drawings.
- Wood siding to match existing wood siding. Window and door wood trim to match existing first story wood trim.
- Asphalt shingles to match existing roof.
- Wrought iron railing to be located in front of the double doors/windows on the east elevation.
- Cut sheet for doors and windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

HOLDOVERS

5. 15-4-20c

936 North Fourth Street

Nick Gore (Applicant)

Kevin Noesner (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application #15-4-20c, 936 North Fourth Street, for installation of new signage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 16, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (6-0-0) CONTINUED

6. 15-4-29 (New Application/Exterior Alteration)

1044 North High Street

Brian Swanson (Applicant)

Fred Maloof (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application #15-4-29, 1044 North High Street, for installation of new NanaWall storefront system, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 16, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) CONTINUED

VARIANCE RECOMMENDATIONS

7. 15-5-17

200 East Fourth Avenue

Andrew Losinske (Applicant)

Heidi Koestner (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Continue Application #15-5-17, 200 East Fourth Avenue, for a parking variance recommendation, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 16, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commission has concerns about the lack of a tracking system for off-site parking lease agreements. Specifically, there has been an issue with multiple lease agreements being made for the use of one lot by multiple businesses.
- There is some concern about having a long-term surface parking area at the corner of Fourth Avenue and Fourth Street.
- Further research is needed regarding possible options for off-site parking.
- Note: The Commission directs HPO staff to contact the Department of Public Service to request a preliminary understanding of the expectations for parking in the North Fourth Street corridor, so the Commission can responsibly respond to parking variance applications in this area and keep the progressive growth of the neighborhood moving forward.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) CONTINUED

8. 15-5-18

285-295 East Fourth Avenue

Connie Klema (Applicant)

The New Victorians, Inc. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #15-5-18, Commissioner Sudy noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Upon review of Application #15-5-18, 285-295 East Fourth Avenue, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed rezoning and variances, as follows:

Request for Rezoning Recommendation

- Request for recommendation for rezoning from R-4 Residential Use and M-2 Manufacturing Use to AR-2 Apartment Residential Use.

Request for Variance Recommendation

References are to proposed lots as follows:

West lot that will be 10,640 sq. ft. "Lot #1"

East lot that will be 15,960 sq. ft. "Lot #2"

- 1. 3333.025 AR-2 apartment residential district use: To permit a dwelling containing fewer than three dwelling units and to permit one dwelling unit on Lot #1.
- 2. 3333.13 AR-2 area district requirements: To permit an apartment complex on a single lot that is less than 20,000 square feet and to be 15,960 square feet on Lot #2.
- 3. 3333.15(c) Basis of computing area: To permit residential buildings to be erected and occupy together greater than 50 percent of the lot area and to be 51% of the lot area on Lot #2.
- 4. 3333.16 Fronting: To permit an apartment house to not front on a public street on Lot #2.
- 5. 3333.18(D) Building lines: To permit setbacks to be less than ten feet (10') and to be 7' 1/8" along Sixth Avenue and 5' 4 7/8" along Fourth Avenue on Lot #1 and 6' 8 1/2" along Fourth Avenue on Lot #2.
- 6. 3333.25 Perimeter yard: To permit a perimeter yard to be less than ten feet and to be zero feet along the south and east property line of Lot #1, and to be 5' 2 1/2" along the south property line and 0 feet along the east property line of Lot #2 and to permit a dumpster to be located in the east perimeter yard of Lot #2.
- 7. 3312.13 Driveway: To permit a one way driveway serving more than eight parking spaces to be less than 20' wide and to be 12' 5.5" wide.
- 8. 3312.25 Maneuvering: To permit maneuvering for one car (noted as C8 on site plan) to not be exclusive and to be shared on Lot #1 and to permit maneuvering to occur over the property line on Lot #2.
- 9. 3312.49 Off street parking: To permit less than 13 parking spaces on Lot #1 and to permit 11.
- 10. 3321.01(A) Dumpster: To permit a dumpster to be located in a perimeter yard.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-1[Sudy]) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

NEW APPLICATIONS

9. 15-5-19

1167 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Romeo Issa & Moe Hassan (Applicant)

Roman & Deborah Czech (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #15-5-19, Commissioner Sudy returned to the table.

Following the presentation by the Applicants, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Approve Application #15-5-19, 1167 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Retain and Modify Existing Patio Enclosure

- Retain the existing metal frame and plastic corrugated roof.
- Remove the existing, faux wood-grain, paneled fascia from the front/east and north elevations.
- Install new, corrugated metal fascia on the front/east and north elevations, painted black.
- Elevation and section drawing of the new metal fascia to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to commencement of ANY exterior work.
- All metal framing and fascia to be painted black.

- The existing, moveable, vinyl walls are to be left in the rolled up (open) position during seasons when the patio is in use, and may be rolled down (closed) only during seasons when the patio is unoccupied.
- All existing string lighting to be removed. Any new lighting fixtures and locations to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- The Commission recommends the installation of planter boxes, to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- No additional exterior signage is approved at this time.

MOTION: Sudy/Sutton (6-0-0) APPROVED

10. 15-5-20

1101 Say Avenue

Blostein/Overly Architecture (Applicant)

Matthew Brackman & Joe Benner (Owners)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Approve Application #15-5-20, 1101 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Modify Previous Approval

- Modify existing window composition of the north and south dormers, per the submitted drawings, dated May 5, 2015. All windows on the north dormer to be the same height.
- Modify the west elevation, per the submitted drawings, dated May 5, 2015.
- The Commission strongly recommends leaving a strip of unpaved green space at the front of the building to provide a planting area.
- Cut sheet for new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: COA # 15-5-20 modifies COA # 14-11-19, issued 11-18-2014, relating to

MOTION: Goodman/Lapp (5-1[Cooke]-0) APPROVED

11. 15-4-37 (New Application/New Construction)

266 East Third Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

Prior to review of Applications #15-4-37 and 15-4-38, Commissioner Sudy noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated

Approve Application #15-4-37, 266 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction

- Construct a new, two-story, frame, single-family dwelling with detached garage, per the submitted site plan.
- Siding for house and garage to be 4" HardiePlank siding with 1 x 6 wood trim.
- Windows to be one-over-one, double-hung sash windows. Windows may be aluminum-clad wood or fiberglass-clad wood, with historically proportioned rails and stiles.
- Roof to be asphalt shingle from the approved roofing shingle list with continuous metal ridge roll.
- Foundation to be plain-faced block.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Roof of the second story balcony to be shed rather than gabled.
- Cut sheets for exterior doors, windows, and light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Landscape plan to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to implementation.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (4-1[Goodman]-1[Sudy]) APPROVED

12. 15-4-38 (New Application/New Construction)

No Address/SW crnr. Second Avenue & Fourth Street (formerly 941-943 N. Fourth St.)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated
Approve Application #15-4-38, 941-943 N. Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction

- Construct a new, two-story, frame, two-family dwelling with attached garages.
- Siding to be 5 1/4" HardiePlank siding with 1 x 6 wood trim on the first and second floors, and 7 1/4" exposure on the third floor. The Commission recommends brick exterior cladding on the main body of the building.
- Commission recommends increasing the width of the porch facing onto North Fourth Street by one bay.
- Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval by a sub-committee of Commissioners Hagerling and Cooke, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Cut sheets for exterior doors, windows, and light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-1[Goodman]-1[Sudy]) APPROVED

13. 15-4-32a

920 North High Street

Sketch Blue on behalf of Donatos (Applicant)

Emerald Light Investments, Ltd. (Owner)

Prior to review of Applications #15-4-32, Commissioner Hagerling noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room. Commissioner Sudy returned to the table and assumed the role of Chairperson.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:
Approve Application #15-4-32a, 920 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Projecting Sign/West Elevation/Donatos

- Install one (1) new, double-sided, reclaimed wood, projecting sign, per the submitted renderings. (Total approx. 4 sq. ft.).
- Sign to be weathered white oak or similar, 1.5" or thicker, with matte finish.
- Laser etched sign logo to read "DONATOS" in black and "PIZZA LOVE" in red (PMS 187).

Projecting Sign/West Elevation/Black Brick

- Install one (1) new, double-sided, reclaimed wood, projecting sign, per the submitted renderings. (Total approx. 4 sq. ft.).
- Sign to be weathered white oak or similar, 1.5" or thicker, with matte finish.
- Laser etched sign logo to read "BLACK BRICK" in black.

Door Graphic/West Elevation/Donatos

- Install door graphic on the reclaimed wood door, per the submitted renderings. (Total approx. 22 sq. ft.).
- Apply two-toned, painted/stained graphic directly to the wood door and apply clear coat.

Window Graphics/West Elevation/Donatos

- Install frosted, laser cut, vinyl address numbers "920" above the Donatos entrance door, per the submitted renderings. (Total approx. 3.2 sq. ft.).
- Install clear, window vinyl, white typography on windows adjacent to the Donatos entrance doors, per the submitted renderings. To include brand message, seasonal menus, and store hours. (Total approx. 11.75 sq. ft.).

Window Graphics/West Elevation/Black Brick

- Install laser cut, matte, white vinyl graphics on Black Brick windows and entrance doors, per the submitted renderings. (Total approx. 1.2 sq. ft.).

Drive-Thru Awning/ Wall Sign /East Elevation /Donatos

- Install one (1) wall sign above the drive-thru awning, per the submitted rendering. (Total approx. 13.4 sq. ft.).
- Opaque, white channel letters to be pin mounted to building, with LED, halo illumination.
- Front face and sides to be "Matte White."
- Illumination to be "Bright White."

Wall Sign /West Elevation/Black Brick

- Install one (1) wall sign above Black Brick the front entrance, per the submitted rendering. (Total approx. 6.7 sq. ft.).
- Opaque, white, open face, channel letters to be pin mounted to building, with LED, to suggest neon.
- Front face and sides to be “Matte White.”
- Illumination to be “Bright White.”

Artist’s Billboard/North Elevation

- Murals to be laser cut, brick grip vinyl, or hand painted, and applied directly to exterior building surface. (Total approx. 180sq. ft.).

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

15-4-32b

Continue Application #15-4-32b, 920 North High Street, for new signage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 16, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

Commissioner Comments:

Painted Vertical Logotype/West Elevation/Donatos

- Please submit the following additional information: 1) A brick and paint sample showing the color of paint and level of transparency/contrast; 2) A study of the vertical logo engaged in one of the openings, and slightly reduced in size.

Drive-Thru/Wall Graphics/East Elevation/Donatos

- Please submit the following additional information: 1) A brick and paint sample showing the color of paint and level of transparency/contrast.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) CONTINUED

14. 14-11-22

Jeffrey Park Apartments/Phase IV/Building K/Waldron Street

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

Prior to review of Applications #14-11-22, Commissioner Hagerling returned to the table and resumed the role of Chairperson.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Based on the revised renderings submitted for the May 21, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting (dated May 18, 2015), the Commission grants conditional approval of Application #14-11-22, Jeffrey Park Apartments/Phase IV/Building K/Waldron Street, for the construction of a new 216 unit, five-story apartment building, with 146 surface parking spaces and 265 parking garage spaces within a two level parking deck as part of the overall Jeffrey Park Development, in regard to the following items, and with all clarifications, as noted.:

- Site plan, footprint, use, scale, height, massing, density, and parking.
- The Commission strongly encourages the Applicant to study lowering the height of the parapet on the building adjacent to (east of) the “white” building located on the south end.
- Final approval is based on review and approval of additional materials, including, but not limited to: Elevation drawings, windows, materials samples, streetscape elements, landscape plan (including rear parking area), exterior lighting (including garage lighting), and exterior garage details.

Note: A Certificate of Appropriateness will be issued upon final approval by the Italian Village Commission of elevation drawings and any/all details, building materials, and finishes.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (4-2[Goodman-Sutton]-0) CONDITIONAL APPROVAL GRANTED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

15. 15-5-21

1160 North High Street & 14 East Fourth Avenue

Behal Sampson Dietz Architects (Applicant)

Stonewall Columbus, Inc. (Owner)

Construct Steel & Glass Bridge

- Connect the two existing buildings with a steel and glass bridge, per the submitted drawings.
- Add an open, steel exit stairwell to the north side of 14 East Fourth Avenue.
- Add glass doors on the east wall of 1160 North High Street and on the west and north walls of 14 East Fourth Avenue.
- Create a dumpster enclosure at the northeast corner of the property.
- Install new landscaping east of 14 East Fourth Avenue.
- Provide handicap entrance in the existing opening on the east side of 14 East Fourth Avenue.
- Install new aluminum storefront system in the 14 East Fourth Avenue storefront openings.
- Install suspended logo over front entrance of 1160 North High Street.
- Install signage on 14 East Fourth Avenue frontage.
- Create a roof terrace on 1160 North High Street.

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Generally in favor of the proposal to connect the two buildings; could be artful and exciting.
- Thinks the storefronts on the Fourth Avenue building should be in some way connected to the design theme of the connector and stairway. It should make a statement with color or perhaps awnings.
- Does not think the SWC logo on the long horizontal pole on the High Street building works well. It does not serve the pedestrian.
- Recommends utilizing the existing sign, which has branded the corner for many years.
- Supports the outdoor space. The height of the lighting will be important.
- Glad that the bank building is being saved.
- Thinks that the stone surround of the bank building entrance needs to remain.

Jason Sudy:

- Cutting in some planting beds and relocating the dumpster to the rear is the right thing to do.
- Consider whether access could be moved from High Street to the alley, and provide some plaza/gathering space along the High Street corridor. Possibly lose one-two parking spaces.
- Will be interested in more details of any roofing or enclosure required for the stairway. Could be really interesting.
- Thinks that the stone surround of the bank storefront is a defining feature of the building.

Josh Lapp:

- Questioned how a raised skywalk fits into the Short North Design Guidelines. Concerns about raising pedestrians off the street.
- Thinks a small connecting addition at the ground and upper floors would be more appropriate.
- Buildings from the 1950s are historic, and appreciation for them will increase as time goes by.

Rex Hagerling

- Would not want to promote skywalks, but sees this as a connector rather than a skywalk, such as used in industrial buildings.
- Would not support the horizontal pole across the top of the High Street building.

- The stairway looks a bit heavy as proposed.
- Needs to take a closer look at the storefronts of the Fourth Avenue building to try to get a better understanding of the history of the brick and wood infills.

Ben Goodman

- Likes the idea of accessing the lot from the alley.
- Could be supportive of the bridge, but thinks they should feel like one feature, rather than being on two different planes.
- Could be supportive of a terrace on top of the High Street building.
- Thinks the proposed logo above the bank building somewhat diminishes the existing entrance. A unique sign already exists and should be utilized.

Charmaine Sutton

- Abstained

NO ACTION TAKEN

16. 15-5-22

995 North Fourth Street

Brad Parish/Architectural Alliance (Applicant)

Capitol Equities (Owner)

Renovations to Brick Building

- Paint previously painted exterior walls.
- Install new windows on all elevations.
- Install new storefront and aluminum/glass overhead door on the front/east elevation.
- Install new signage canopy on front/east elevation.
- Install new aluminum/glass overhead door on the rear/west elevation.
- Install new metal door on rear/west elevation.
- Install new fiber cement board siding on rear and side elevations, per the submitted drawings.

Renovations to Concrete Block Building

- Paint previously painted, exterior concrete block walls, and install new fiber cement board siding and EIFS, as noted on all elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new metal canopies, as noted on all elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new aluminum storefront windows and doors, as noted on all elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- Install metal infill panels at top of windows on west elevation.
- Install new signage on east, north, and west elevations.

West Parking Lot

- Pave area on the west side of the lots, to provide 42 parking spaces, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new fence and landscaping, per the submitted site plan.

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Thinks that the existing brick building and the existing concrete block building should each retain their own separate history and character and should not be connected by use of the same materials.
- Thinks the proposed signage canopy on the façade of the brick building is not the right solution.
- A brick or wrought iron fence may be appropriate for the brick building.
- Will need to think about trash pickup and dumpster locations.
- Thinks that creativity is shown in breaking down the scale of the very large concrete block building into four separate retail spaces. Encourages colors and materials on the block building be very different from the brick

building. The proposed design is a good graphic solution to wrapping a rather uninteresting building in a way that could draw some positive attention. Thinks the design speaks retail.

- Because this building is set back from Fourth Street, thinks that some lighting could be used beneath the canopies to create a wash on the storefronts.
- A final plan for any surface parking lot would need to include sidewalks to make the area walkable for pedestrians.

Ben Goodman:

- Does not have major concerns about the proposed addition to the brick building. Using a contrasting exterior cladding material is appropriate.
- Consider whether some features of the rear, second story window could be retained.
- Agrees with Commissioner Hagerling regarding restoration of the façade of the gabled section of the brick building.
- Agrees with Commissioner Cooke regarding the creative design for the concrete block building.
- The signage sort of appears like postage stamps on top of an already cool feature. Thinks the “Fourth” and “Third” on the corner works better (dimensional letters). Or, just make each storefront in full color.
- More texture on the letters may work well.
- Would want the fencing to be solid rather than tube aluminum.
- Start thinking about how lighting will work with the storefronts.
- Not sure that it would continue to stay in place for ten years or more if a parking lot was installed at these lots.
- Could be supportive of a lot on these sites if it could be developed in a way to provide a few parallel spaces that could be used by community residents. Thinks there are ways to get to a solution. Paving materials would have an impact on a decision for a lot.
- Likes the idea of getting a sidewalk onto Hamlet Street or Punta Alley.

Rex Hagerling:

- Thinks that windows on the brick building should be wood to match the original material. Something like the existing windows of the Berry Bolt building could be appropriate.
- Requests that the applicant do further study on the (right) carriage opening on the façade of the brick building, where a segmental arch is visible above the opening.
- Would like to see the gable section of the brick building restored more to its original appearance. If the building is to be painted, some altering of the masonry could be covered with paint.
- The left carriage door opening could be glass but there are ways it could be a bit more in keeping with the character of the building.
- In general agreement with Commissioners Cooke and Goodman regarding the design of the concrete block building. Would like to see the more historic section of the rear wall preserved in some way. Would not make that section radically different from the brick building.
- Thinks the proposed multi-light windows for the block building give it some interest.
- If there was some space along Third Avenue for some small structures, it would be a lot easier to look at it favorably.

Josh Lapp:

- Thinks the proposed color for the brick building is appropriate.
- No comments regarding the concrete block building.
- Thinks that a surface lot could work with a portion reserved as green space/landscaping. Not all hardscaped.
- Can think of no other context where the Commission has approved a large scale parking lot directly adjacent to single family homes.

Jason Sudy:

- If painting the brick building is determined to be appropriate, would not be in favor of using a color to match the existing brick color.
- The size of the window openings on the brick building need to remain the same size, not extended to the ground.

- Not too concerned about the proposed, large glass door in the front (left) carriage door opening on the façade of the brick building, because it appears that the opening may have been modified multiple times.
- No issues with the design of the concrete block building. Would rather see the lots developed.
- If a parking lot was to be located at the rear of the buildings, thinks the proposed screening and fencing would be the way to go, but is not convinced that is what should happen on these lots.
- Has concerns about creating a long term, permanently paved parking lot. Does not think it is the right thing to do
- Has concerns about creating a paid lot for use by businesses at other locations.
- Does not think a surface lot in a location fronting existing residents on neighborhood scale street is appropriate. Thinks it is preferable for a surface lot to be bordered by an alley in the rear or developed in a fashion where the lot would be screened by other buildings.

NO ACTION TAKEN

17. 15-3-19

1086 & 1050 North Fourth Street – Budd Dairy Redevelopment

Tim Lai (Applicant)

Lykens Companies (Owner)

Demolition

- Demolish the five (5) existing, brick garage and warehouse buildings located to the rear of the two-story Budd Dairy building.
- Demolish the existing concrete block building at 1050 North Fourth Street.

New Construction

- Construct four new buildings, per the submitted site plan and renderings.

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Was much more impressed by the Budd Dairy warehouses than expected and was less impressed by the Durable Slate building (1050) than expected (*Based on the site visit conducted by the Commissioners at 1050 & 1086 N. Fourth Street on May 4, 2015*). The 1050 N. Fourth St. building shows a lot of deterioration, including the façade. Thinks it would be good to memorialize the stone “lightning bolts” if possible, but thinks the building could be demolished.
- The courtyard and most of the warehouse buildings of the Budd Dairy are very impressive and it feels “neighborhoody.” Does not think the proposed replacement building has a neighborhood feeling. Thinks there are opportunities for reuse of the warehouses, even if some are for parking.
- Could support bigger buildings facing onto Fourth Street.
- Would be willing to look at additional openings on the warehouse buildings, especially where changes have already been made.
- Adding additional curb cuts would be a tough issue.
- Could see having one lower access point off of Fourth Avenue for several below grade parking spaces.

David Cooke:

- Did not tour the 1050 N. Fourth St. building. As a preservation commissioner, thinks the warehouses of the Budd Dairy are a “sacred cow.” They are a part of the history of the area. They are unique examples of highly desirable buildings that give uniqueness to the neighborhood.

Ben Goodman:

- In agreement with comments of Commissioners Cooke and Sudy.
- Would be reluctant to support multiple new openings punched into the warehouse buildings.

Josh Lapp:

- Does like the idea of integrating parking into some pieces of the warehouses.

- Did not attend the site visit, but went to look at the 1050 N. Fourth St. building. Agrees that the building seems very deteriorated. Thinks the proposed design for new construction at 1050 N. Fourth Street seems appropriate. It recalls the character of the existing building but is not an exact replication.
- Understands that preserving the warehouse buildings will result in lower density than desired by the applicant, but thinks that greater density could be allowed in the front buildings.

Rex Hagerling:

- In general agreement with comments of fellow Commissioners.
- Thinks something cool could be done with the 1050 N. Fourth Street building, but is flexible on that building. The front is very deteriorated, but would want to see some pieces of the façade memorialized in some way.
- The Budd Dairy warehouse buildings are the very essence of Italian Village. Thinks the building that is directly behind the main building and is largely concrete block is the only one that could be demolished or changed or a pass through.
- Approval of any additional door openings on the warehouses would depend on the design.
- Reluctant to add stories to the warehouse buildings.

Charmaine Sutton

- In general agreement with comments of fellow commissioners.
- If the Durable Slate building is demolished, agrees it should be memorialized in some way, but would like to see the design pushed in some way. Doesn't have to look like the existing building with a second story.
- Does not have an issue with front-loading parking as long as it is done well.

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVALS

• **15-5-1**

192-194 East Second Avenue

Will Carrel/Contractor (Applicant)

Jack Zweig (Owner)

Approve Application 15-5-1, 192-194 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Install new half-round gutters on the crown molding, due to box gutters being previously covered with an extended roof.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia and crown molding with new wood of same dimension, as necessary.
- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new, 5", half-round metal gutters and new round, metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Install New Drain Pipe From Downspouts

- Install new drain pipes from the gutter/downspouts, beneath the public sidewalk to the existing stone curb, in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- Reinstall any damaged stone curbing, like-for-like, as needed. New curbing not to be concrete.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public and service sidewalks and steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish coat paint colors to match existing.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

Porch Repair

- Repair/replace the existing concrete porch deck, as needed, with new concrete, like-for-like.

Repair Masonry Retaining Wall

- Remove any/all damaged concrete block and replace with concrete block that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- Moisten surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).
- The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.

- **15-5-2**

682 North High Street

Alissa Head, Mngr. Global Gifts (Applicant)

The Wood Companies (Owners)

Approve Application #15-5-2, 682 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Signage

- Install new, burgundy color, vinyl lettering signage to read "Global Gifts: A Fair Trade Store," per the submitted rendering.
- Signage to be located in the sign band above the storefront windows, to match the two neighboring businesses.
- The existing vinyl lettering on the storefront windows is to be removed.

Note: COA # 15-5-2 modifies the color and font only for the previously approved signage (COA #15-2-2 / approved 2-17-2015).

- **15-5-3**

830 North High Street

James Brooks/Custom Sign Center (Applicant)

E.W. Hubbard High, LLC (Owners)

Approve Application #15-5-3, 830 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Modify Existing Projecting Sign

- Change the existing background color of the existing projecting sign from metallic gray to PMS 368 (green), per the submitted drawing and material/color sample.

Note: COA # 15-5-3 modifies the color only for the previously approved sign (COA #13-10-8 / approved 10-15-2013).

• **15-5-4**

55 East Warren Street

Jenifer Teitt/The Bellepoint Company (Applicant)

Jason Thompson (Owners)

Approve Application #15-5-4, 55 East Warren Street, for renewal of expired COA # 14-2-3c (Expired: February 18, 2014), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove existing deteriorated slate, and install new asphalt shingle roof, per the submitted specifications.
- Remove all deteriorated slate on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Owens Corning, (standard 3-tab), "Estate Gray."
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or gray.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or gray.
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Front Porch Roof

- Power wash existing, metal, front porch roof and apply metal ready primer and gray tinted elastomeric roof coating.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED

• **15-5-5**

723-729 Kerr Street

Ben Shoemaker (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-5, 723-729 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:
Certain Teed

Style:
(standard 3-tab)

Color:
Nickel Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat portion of the roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair or Replace Gutters & Downspouts:

- Repair and or replace gutters and downspouts, as needed.

Replace Existing Hat Vents:

- Replace five (5) existing hat vents with new hat vents; no new hat vents to be added.

• **15-5-6**

959 Mount Pleasant Avenue

Matthew Minerd (Applicant)

Matthew Minerd & Amelia Dunlap (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-6, 959 Mount Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Exterior Painting – House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house and fiber cement surfaces on the garage for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be Sherwin Williams Downing Stone (2821) as primary and Sherwin Williams Sage Green Light (2851) for trim, as shown in submittal.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

• **15-5-7**

830 North High Street

James Brooks/Custom Sign Center (Applicant)

E.W. Hubbard High, LLC (Owners)

Approve Application #15-5-7, 830 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Modify Existing Projecting Sign

- Change the existing graphic (logo with the name "Huntington") and metallic gray color of the existing projecting sign to include the Huntington logo only on a PMS 368 (green) field, per the submitted drawing and material/color sample.

Note: COA # 15-5-3 modifies the sign face only for the previously approved sign, COA #15-5-3, issued 4-22-2015.

- **15-5-8**

181-183 East Second Avenue

Julio Valenzuela (Applicant)

Hamlet & Second LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-8, 181-183 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Existing clay coping at parapet walls to be retained.

- **15-5-9**

950-952 Hamlet Street

Julio Valenzuela (Applicant)

Hamlet & Second LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-9, 950-952 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Existing clay coping at parapet walls to be retained.

- **15-5-10**

944-946 Hamlet Street

Julio Valenzuela (Applicant)

Hamlet & Second LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-9, 950-952 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Existing clay coping at parapet walls to be retained.

- **15-5-11**

143-145 East Third Avenue

Kimberly Wells (Applicant)

Kimberly Wells/Purple Kangaroo, LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-11, 143-145 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish coat paint colors to be as follows: Main Body – Behr “Opera Glass”; Trim – Behr “Statuesque”; and Doors – Behr “Red My Mind.”
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **15-5-12**

151 East Third Avenue

Mark Grillo (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-5-12, 151 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Gate

- Install one (1) new, spring-loaded, 12'8" wide, double-swing gate on the west side of the existing six-foot-high, wood privacy fence.
- Gate frame to be 1 5/8" round steel tubing and installed on existing wood posts.
- New cedar gate to match the height and construction/framing of the existing cedar fence.
- All work to be in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Codes and industry standards.

- **15-5-13**

163 Punta Alley

Heidi Bolyard/Simplified Living Architecture (Applicant)

Gretchen Stephenson (Owner)

Converted to Staff Approval following HPO Staff presentation at the May 12th IVC Business Meeting.

Approve Application #15-5-13, 163 Punta Alley, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Door

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, wood, 2' 8" wide, ¾ -lite door on the rear elevation, per the submitted photographs.
- Install a new, 3' wide, Jeld-Wen, full-lite (no muntins) Custom Wood patio door with wood transom (no muntins), per the submitted product cut sheet.

Note: The Commission strongly recommends that the ¾ -lite door be consigned to an architectural salvage company for reuse.

Install Closed, Fixed Shutters

- Remove one existing window on the east elevation at the rear of the main section of the house, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, fixed, wood shutters in the closed position, to match the existing wood shutters on the adjacent window.
- The one, existing, two-over-two, double-hung sash window on the east elevation near the front of the main section of the house is to remain, as is.

- **15-5-14**

1081 North Fourth Street

Barb Judson/Mae Fence (Applicant)

Michael Young (Owner)

Converted to Staff Approval following HPO Staff presentation at the May 12th IVC Business Meeting.

Approve Application #15-5-14, 1081 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Fence

- Install approximately seventy feet of 36" high, black, aluminum fence, along the south, east, and north sides of the front yard, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheet/specifications.
- New fence is to extend eastward, in line with the neighboring wood fence at 1077 N. Fourth Street; then northward, along the front of the property, to the existing hedgerow; then westward to the northeast corner of the house.
- Matching aluminum gates to be located at the service sidewalk, per the submitted site plan.
- The top line of all fencing is to be level.

XI. OLD BUSINESS

- **15-5-19**

1085 Summit Street

Susan Keeny (Applicant)

Bob Mickley (Owner)

- Historic Preservation Office staff provided an update on siding and windows, as installed.
- The installed, faux-grain cementitious siding and trim have been removed and replaced with smooth, cementitious siding with the appropriate reveal.
- The Commission viewed a sample Andersen Integrity window, as provided by the Applicant.
- HPO staff recommended that the window should be accepted, as installed, but staff and the commission need to be more aware of the exact windows being proposed for future projects. Staff recommends that the Andersen Integrity window should not be approved for future projects due to the inappropriate profile, width of stiles and rails, and its one-dimensionality.

NO ACTION TAKEN

- **15-5-23**

1024 N. High Street

Elford Development (Applicant/Owner)

Change Paint Color

- Change the color of the narrow vertical strip, and the narrow horizontal strip of brick on the south elevation of the Fireproof Building from "red" to "dark grey" per the submitted photoshop images.

The Commission viewed the existing and proposed colors. Commissioner Hagerling will go to the site to look at the building before making a final decision on the modification of colors.

XII. NEW BUSINESS

XIII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Lapp/Sutton (6-0-0) ADJOURNED 10:33 p.m.)